

**STATE OF FLORIDA
COMMISSION ON ETHICS**

Friday, April 25, 2025

*Third Floor Courtroom, First District Court of Appeal
2000 Drayton Drive
Tallahassee, Florida*

PUBLIC SESSION MINUTES

At 8:40 a.m. Vice Chair Tina Descovich called the meeting to order with the following members present:

JAMES BUSH, III
TINA DESCOVICH
FREDDIE FIGGERS
ASHLEY LUKIS
LINDA STEWART

Paul Bain, Luis M. Fusté, and Laird A. Lile were absent from the meeting.

The presence of a quorum was noted.

Commissioner Bush, seconded by Commissioner Figgers, moved to approve the minutes of the March 7, 2025, Public Session meeting. By unanimous vote, the motion carried.

CONSIDERATION OF FINAL ACTION – 1DCA MANDATE

Complaint Nos. 20-060, 20-073, 20-103 (cons.), In re DOUGLAS UNDERHILL

Present were Mark Herron, Attorney for the Respondent; and Melody A. Hadley, Commission Advocate.

Assistant General Counsel Gray Schafer summarized the Final Order Upon Mandate of the First District Court of Appeal calling for a finding of violation of Section 112.3148(8), Florida Statutes, and a recommended penalty of public censure and reprimand, and a civil penalty of \$5,000.

Mr. Herron was heard by the Commission.

Commissioner Lukis, seconded by Commissioner Bush, moved to approve the proposed joint stipulation. By unanimous vote, the motion carried.

CONSIDERATION OF FINAL ACTION – JOINT STIPULATION

Complaint No. 23-283, In re ANGELA MCDONALD

Present was Melody A. Hadley, Commission Advocate.

Ms. Hadley summarized the proposed amended joint stipulation calling for a finding of violation of Section 112.3148(8), Florida Statutes, and a recommended penalty of public censure and reprimand, and a civil penalty of \$500.

Commissioner Lukis, seconded by Commissioner Bush, moved to approve the proposed amended joint stipulation. By unanimous vote, the motion carried.

Complaint No. 24-008, In re KENNETH BRENNER

Present was Joseph Burns, Commission Advocate.

Mr. Burns summarized the proposed joint stipulation calling for a finding of violation of Article II, Section 8, Florida Constitution, and Section 112.3144, Florida Statutes, and a recommended civil penalty of \$250.

Commissioner Lukis, seconded by Commissioner Bush, moved to approve the proposed joint stipulation. By unanimous vote, the motion carried.

Complaint No. 24-048, In re RON MUELLER

Present was Melody A. Hadley, Commission Advocate.

Ms. Hadley summarized the proposed amended joint stipulation calling for a finding of violation of Section 112.3148(8), Florida Statutes, and a recommended penalty of public censure and reprimand, and a civil penalty of \$250.

Commissioner Bush, seconded by Commissioner Figgers, moved to approve the proposed amended joint stipulation. By unanimous vote, the motion carried.

CONSIDERATION OF LEGAL SUFFICIENCY

Complaint No. 25-047, In re JOANNE ALVAREZ

Staff Attorney Amelia Naomi recommended that the complaint be dismissed as legally insufficient based on the rationale contained in the written recommendation previously provided to Commissioners.

Commissioner Stewart, seconded by Commissioner Figgers, moved to approve the staff's recommendation. By unanimous vote, the motion carried.

CONSIDERATION OF ADVISORY OPINION

File 2818. CONFLICT OF INTEREST: COUNTY OFFICERS AND EMPLOYEES SERVING AS DIRECTORS AND PERFORMING TASKS FOR A BUSINESS ENTITY CREATED BY THE COUNTY TO ASSIST IN PUBLIC HOUSING MATTERS

No one was present for this opinion.

Assistant General Counsel Gray Schafer explained the basis of the draft advisory opinion and the rationale behind its conclusion.

Commissioner Stewart, seconded by Commissioner Lukis, moved to approve the draft opinion. The motion carried, with Commissioner Bush voting no.

CONSIDERATION OF EXECUTIVE BRANCH LOBBYING FIRM FINE APPEAL

L25-001, In re THE POLICY STANDARD, LLC

Assistant General Counsel Gray Schafer explained the draft order and the rationale behind its conclusion.

Commissioner Lukis, seconded by Commissioner Figgers, moved to adopt the staff draft order denying the appeal and affirming the fine. By unanimous vote, the motion carried.

CONSIDERATION OF FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE APPEALS

HEARING

No one was present for this appeal.

FD21-028, In re BEN KING

Staff Attorney Stephanie Novenario explained the basis of the draft final order and the rationale behind its conclusion.

Commissioner Stewart, seconded by Commissioner Figgers, moved to approve the staff's recommendation. By unanimous vote, the motion carried.

NO HEARING

No one was present for any of the appeals.

**FD21-017, In re MATTHEW YOUNG
FD21-020, In re ANGELIQUE COOK**

FD21-033, In re GENE L. HERMAN
FD21-044, In re JULIANA MANJARRES
FD21-048, In re DAVID EHRET
FD21-051, In re LISA FERNANDEZ
FD21-056, In re JUDEEN JOHNSON
FD21-060, In re MICHAEL D. MURPHY
FD22-021, In re PAMELA HARRISON
FD23-011, In re REINALDO DIAZ
FD24-002, In re REINALDO DIAZ

Commissioner Lukis, seconded by Commissioner Figgers, moved to approve the staff's recommendations. By unanimous vote, the motion carried.

FD20-060, In re CALEB DECIUS

Staff Attorney Amelia Naomi explained the basis of the draft final order and the rationale behind its conclusion.

Commissioner Lukis, seconded by Commissioner Bush, moved to reject the staff's recommendation and waive the fine. By unanimous vote, the motion carried.

**CONSIDERATION OF FINAL ORDERS ON FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE FINES
WHERE THERE HAS BEEN NO TIMELY APPEAL AND NO PAYMENT**

Commissioner Lukis, seconded by Commissioner Bush, moved to approve the entry, as put forth by the Commission staff, of Final Orders on financial disclosure fines where there has been no timely appeal and no payment. By unanimous vote, the motion carried.

**CONSIDERATION OF ORDERS DECLARING FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE FINES
UNCOLLECTIBLE**

Commissioner Lukis, seconded by Commissioner Bush, moved to declare these fines uncollectible. By unanimous vote, the motion carried.

REPORTS

The Chair had no report.

Executive Director Kerrie Stillman elaborated on her written Executive Director's report previously provided to the Commissioners. General Counsel Steven Zuilkowski updated the Commission on litigation status.

Executive Director Kerrie Stillman elaborated on her written legislative report previously provided to the Commissioners.

Executive Director Kerrie Stillman updated the Commission on the e-filing system and the launch of the Financial Disclosure Fines portion of EFDMS.

ADJOURNMENT

With no further items on the agenda, the Public Session adjourned at 10:01 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Approved:

Diana Westberry, *Secretary*

Luis M. Fusté, *Chair*

Date